

COPY

**IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS
HENRY COUNTY, OHIO**

**STATE OF OHIO, ex rel. :
BETTY D. MONTGOMERY :
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OHIO, :
Environmental Enforcement Section :
30 East Broad St., 25th Floor :
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3428 :**

CASE NO. 02CV176

Plaintiff,

v.

**JOSEPH E. GOODELL :
Formerly d.b.a. THE WILLOW HAVEN :
MOBILE HOME PARK :
4540 Brookside Road :
Toledo, Ohio 43615 :**

and

**GARY R. VAN CLEEF :
Formerly d.b.a. THE WILLOW HAVEN :
MOBILE HOME PARK :
2738 Westchester Boulevard :
Ottawa Hills, Ohio 43615 :**

and

**VAN CLEEF, GOODELL, & :
GOODELL PARTNERS :
Formerly d.b.a. THE WILLOW HAVEN :
MOBILE HOME PARK :
2738 Westchester Boulevard :
Ottawa Hills, Ohio 43615 :**

Defendants.

**FILED
HENRY COUNTY
COMMON PLEAS COURT
2003 JUL 28 P 4: 15
JUDY SONNENBERG
CLERK OF COURTS**

CONSENT ORDER .

The Complaint in the above-captioned matter having been filed herein and the Plaintiff, State of Ohio, by and through its counsel, the Attorney General of Ohio ("Plaintiff"), and the Defendants Joseph E. Goodell, formerly d.b.a. Willow Haven Mobile Home Park, Gary Van Cleef, formerly d.b.a. the Willow Haven Mobile Home Park, and Van Cleef, Goodell, & Goodell Partners, formerly d.b.a. the Willow Haven Mobile Home Park ("Defendants"), hereby consent to the entry of this Consent Order.

NOW THEREFORE, without trial of any issue of law or fact, and upon consent of the parties hereto, it is hereby ORDERED, ADJUDGED, and DECREED as follows:

I. JURISDICTION AND VENUE

1. The Court has both personal jurisdiction over the parties and subject matter jurisdiction over the case pursuant to R.C. Chapter 6111. The Complaint states a claim upon which relief can be granted against the Defendants under R.C. Chapter 6111 and the rules and regulations promulgated thereunder. Venue is proper in this Court.

II. PERSONS BOUND

2. All terms and provisions of this Consent Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Plaintiff and the Defendants, the Defendants' agents, officers, employees, assigns, successors in interest, and any other person acting in concert and/or in privity with any of them.

3. The Defendants shall provide a copy of this Consent Order to each engineer, operator, and general contractor and/or consultant employed to perform any and all work itemized herein. The Defendants shall provide a copy of this Consent Order to each of its subcontractors for such work.

III. SATISFACTION OF LAWSUIT AND RESERVATION OF RIGHTS

4. The Plaintiff alleges in its Complaint that the Defendants operated their former wastewater treatment plant ("WWTP") in such a manner as to result in violations of the water pollution control laws of the State of Ohio. Specifically, the Plaintiff alleges in its Complaint that during the times the Defendants exercised ownership and/or control over the operation of the Willow Haven Mobile Home Park, the WWTP serving the Willow Haven Mobile Home Park had been discharging "sewage" to "waters of the State" as those terms are defined in R.C. 6111.01, without a valid and unexpired National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System ("NPDES") permit and had placed or caused to be placed raw or poorly treated "sewage" to "waters of the State". The Plaintiff also alleges in its Complaint that the Defendants, in contravention of the Permit to Install ("PTI") the WWTP, had failed to properly operate and maintain the WWTP and had failed to abandon the WWTP and connect to the public sanitary sewer system when such a system became available and accessible.

5. Compliance with the terms of this Consent Order shall constitute full satisfaction of any civil liability by the Defendants for all claims of violations alleged in the Complaint, including any continuing violations through the date of this Consent Order that are properly reported to Ohio EPA and identified by the State in its Complaint.

6. Nothing in this Consent Order shall be construed so as to limit the authority of the Plaintiff to seek relief against other appropriate persons for claims or conditions alleged in this Complaint. Nothing in this Consent Order shall be construed so as to limit the authority of the Plaintiff to seek relief against the Defendants or any other appropriate persons for claims or conditions not alleged in the Complaint, including violations which occur after the filing of the

Complaint, nor shall anything in this Consent Order limit the right of the Defendants to raise any defenses it may have for such claims. Similarly, nothing in this Consent Order shall be construed so as to limit the authority of the Plaintiff to undertake any action against any person, including the Defendants, to eliminate or mitigate conditions that may present a threat to the public health, welfare, or the environment.

IV. PERMANENT INJUNCTION

7. The Defendants have indicated that they no longer own the Willow Haven Mobile Home Park. The Defendants shall not regain operation or ownership of the Willow Haven Mobile Home Park (or any other mobile home park situated at that location) at any future time.

V. TIME EXTENSIONS

8. If any date for performance falls upon a weekend or state or federal holiday, the time for performance is extended to the next working day following the weekend or holiday.

VI. SUBMITTAL OF DOCUMENTS

9. All required documents required under this Consent Order shall be submitted to:

- a. Ohio EPA
Northwest District Office
347 North Dunbridge Road
Bowling Green, Ohio 43402-9398
Telephone (419) 352-8461 Facsimile (419) 352-8468
Attn: Division Surface Water Enforcement Group Leader

VII. CIVIL PENALTY

10. The Defendants are ordered and enjoined to pay a penalty of \$15,000.00 within sixty (60) days of the signing of this Consent Order by the Court. The civil penalty shall be paid by certified check for the appropriate amount, made payable to "Treasurer, State of Ohio", which check shall be delivered by mail, or otherwise, to Jena Suhadolnik, Administrative Assistant, or

her successor, at the Ohio Attorney General's Office, Environmental Enforcement Section, 30 East Broad Street, 25th Floor, Columbus, Ohio 43215-3428.

VIII. STIPULATED PENALTIES

11. In the event that the Defendants fail to meet any of the deadlines and requirements of this Consent Order, the Defendants shall pay a stipulated penalty for each failure according to the following payment schedule:

- (1) For each day of each failure to meet each deadline or requirement, up to fifteen (15) days -- Two Hundred and Fifty Dollars (\$250.00) per day for each deadline or requirement not met;
- (2) For each day of each failure to meet each deadline or requirement, from sixteen (16) to thirty (30) days -- Five Hundred Dollars (\$500.00) per day for each deadline or requirement not met;
- (3) For each day of each failure to meet each deadline or requirement, from thirty-one (31) to sixty (60) days -- Seven-Hundred and Fifty Dollars (\$750.00) per day for each deadline or requirement not met; and
- (4) For each day of each failure to meet each deadline or requirement, over (61) sixty-one days -- One Thousand Dollars (\$1000.00) per day for each deadline or requirement not met.

12. Any payment required to be made under Section VIII of this Consent Order shall be made by delivering to Jena Suhadolnik, or her successor, at the address set forth in Section VII within forty-five (45) days from the date of the failure to meet the requirement of the Consent Order, a certified check or checks for the appropriate amount(s), made payable to the order of "Treasurer, State of Ohio". The Defendants shall also state in writing the specific failure

of the Consent Order that was not complied with, and the date(s) of non-compliance. The payment of stipulated penalties by Defendants and the acceptance of such stipulated penalties by the Plaintiff for specific violations of this Order shall not be construed to limit the Plaintiff's authority to seek judicial enforcement of this Consent Order.

IX. COMPLIANCE NOT DEPENDENT ON GRANTS OR LOANS

13. Performance of the terms of this Consent Order by the Defendants is not conditioned on the receipt of any federal or state grant or loan funds. In addition, the Defendants' performance is not excused by the failure to obtain any federal or state grant or loan funds, or by the processing of any applications for the same.

X. MISCELLANEOUS

14. Nothing in this Consent Order shall affect the Defendants' obligation to comply with any applicable federal, state, or local law, regulation, rule, or ordinance. The Defendants shall obtain any and all federal, state, or local permits necessary to comply with this Consent Order.

15. The Defendants shall inform Ohio EPA of any change of its business addresses or telephone numbers.

XI. POTENTIAL FORCE MAJEURE

16. If any event occurs which causes or may cause a delay in the Defendants' compliance with any requirement of this Consent Order, the Defendants shall notify Ohio EPA in writing within ten (10) days from when the Defendants knew, or by the exercise of due diligence should have known, of the event. The notification to the Ohio EPA shall describe in detail the anticipated length of the delay, the precise cause or causes of the delay, the measures taken and to be taken by the Defendants to prevent or minimize the delay, and the timetable by

which those measures will be implemented. The Defendants shall adopt all reasonable measures to avoid or minimize any such delay.

17. In any action by the Plaintiff to enforce any of the provisions of this Consent Order, the Defendants may raise that they are entitled to a defense that their conduct was caused by reasons entirely beyond its control such as, by way of example and not limitations, acts of God, strikes, acts of war, or civil disturbances. While the Plaintiff does not agree that such a defense exists, it is, however, hereby agreed upon by the Defendants and the Plaintiff that it is premature at this time to raise and adjudicate the existence of such a defense and that the appropriate point at which to adjudicate the existence of such a defense is at the time, if ever, that a court proceeding to enforce this Consent Order is commenced by the Plaintiff. At that time, the Defendants will bear the burden of proving that any delay was or will be caused by circumstances entirely beyond the control of the Defendants. Unanticipated or increased costs associated with the implementation of any action required by this Consent Order, or a change in the Defendants' financial circumstances, shall not constitute circumstances entirely beyond the control of the Defendants or serve as a basis for an extension of time under this Consent Order. Failure by the Defendants to timely comply with the notice requirements of this Section shall render this Section void and of no force and effect as to the particular incident involved and shall constitute a waiver of the Defendants' right to request an extension of its obligations under this Consent Order based on such incident. An extension of one date based on a particular incident does not mean that the Defendants qualify for an extension of a subsequent date or dates. The Defendants must make an individual showing of proof regarding each incremental step or other requirement for which an extension is sought. Acceptance of this Consent Order without a Force

Majeure Clause does not constitute a waiver by the Defendants of any rights or defenses it may have under applicable law.

XII. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

18. The Court will retain jurisdiction of this action for the purpose of enforcing and administering the Defendants' compliance with this Consent Order.

XIII. COURT COSTS

19. The Defendants are hereby ordered to pay the court costs of this action.

XIV. ENTRY OF CONSENT ORDER AND FINAL JUDGEMENT BY CLERK

20. The parties agree and acknowledge that final approval-by the Plaintiff and the Defendants and entry of this Consent Order is subject to the requirements of 40 C.F.R. 123.27(d)(1)(iii), which provides for notice of the lodging of the Consent Order, opportunity for public comment, and the consideration of any public comments. Both the Plaintiff and the Defendants reserve the right to withdraw this Consent Order based upon comments received during the public comment period. The Defendants shall pay the costs of public notice within thirty (30) days of receipt of a bill or notice from the State of Ohio.

21. Pursuant to Rule 58 of the Ohio Rules of Civil Procedure, upon signing of this Consent Order by the Court, the clerk is hereby directed to enter it upon the journal. Within three (3) days of entering the judgment upon the journal, the clerk is hereby directed to serve upon the parties notice of the judgment and its date of entry upon the journal in the manner prescribed by Rule 5(B) of the Ohio Rules of Civil Procedure and note the service in the appearance docket.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

1st Keith P. Munkfeld

JUDGE, COURT OF COMMON PLEAS
HENRY COUNTY

7/28/03
DATE

APPROVED:

JIM PETRO
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OHIO

Michael E. Buckley 5/15/03

Michael E. Buckley (0069727)
Sherry L. Mowry (0074494)
Assistant Attorneys General
Environmental Enforcement Section
30 East Broad Street, 25th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3428
Telephone (614) 466-2766
Facsimile (614) 644-1926
Email mbuckley@ag.state.oh.us
Email smowry@ag.state.oh.us

Joseph E. Goodell

Joseph E. Goodell

Defendant Owner

Gary R. Van Clee

Gary R. Van Clee

Defendant Owner

[Signature]

Counsel for Defendants